

BARAD-DUR 29

BARAD-DUR, published on alternate Friday evenings by Jack L. Chalker, 5111 Liberty Heights Avenue, Baltimore, Maryland, 21207, USA. Trade arrangements made, or at 10/\$1.00. An N3F Games Bureau affiliate.

Gilliland resigns "c" in protest

Alexis Gilliland has resigned from GB-1965-C in protest over what he calls "gamesmaster errors." Although many gamesmaster errors have been perpetrated on long-suffering players, the point over which he resigns is not and was not an error, but a legitimate interpretation of the rules.

The moves in question (C, #27) run:

ENGLAND	RUSSIA
a kiel to berlin	F SKAG TO DENMARK
f denmark to kiel	F BALTIC (S) SKAG-DENMARK
F HOLLAND (S) den-kiel	a berlin to kiel
f north sea-denmark	
F HEL.B (S) NorS-den	

Of course it would have been simplicity itself for Russia to obtain uncontested control of Denmark -- if Sweden has supported instead of moved. However, Russia chose to go in with two, and I ruled it makes it. Why?

When the rules were written they had holes through which an armored column could be driven. This is one of them, known to give the shudders to all clean-living Gamesmasters -- a SITUATION NOT SPECIFICALLY COVERED IN THE RULES.

There are, then, arguments over legality. So.....The one that Gilliland insists is the correct one would have the English F North Sea, coming in on Denmark with support from the Helgoland Bight, have a factor of 2 anyway and stand off the Russian attack.

I ruled, however, that under my understanding of the rules, the Russian attack succeeded, 2-1. This is based, most specifically, on the rule which states that no unit may be both moved and supported in the province from which it is moving.

All of Gilliland's moves depended on army Kiel being able to move into Berlin. Kiel could not move. Thus, Denmark could not move to Kiel. It stood alone in Denmark, and the two units trying to move into Denmark and cover its advance failed to make it. FLEET NORTH SEA WAS ORDERED TO MOVE, NOT SUPPORT. A supporting action is clearly impossible. F HELGOLAND BIGHT WAS ORDERED TO SUPPORT -- NOT FLEET DENMARK (which would have been illegal) BUT FLEET NORTH SEA INTO DENMARK -- impossible because Denmark did not move and you can not dislodge your own unit.

Thus, the North Sea and Hel.B supports were impossible, under the rules, and therefore Denmark stands UNSUPPORTED, a victim of the two-pronged Russian attack.

If, however, we consider the English North Sea move to Denmark to be, in effect, an attack on Denmark and the unit in it, it would, indeed, stand off the Russian charge -- but only if F Denmark were not there.

If I were to accept that English move as an attack on its own position, which it would be, then it would follow that Kiel, dur-
i

ing the same move, would have had a defense factor of 3 -- that is, A Kiel (which didn't go anyplace) plus the two units trying to get in. This makes it possible for a player to move his piece and support that square at the same time -- SOMETHING SPECIFICALLY PROHIBITED IN THE RULES.

Even if we ignore Kiel's factor, we have, down there, a defense factor in Kiel of 2, leaving Kiel to move. This is illegal. It is a blatant attempt to move, and, if unsuccessful, support the province simultaneously.

There is no paradox, really. The situation is obvious. To rule that Denmark was not dislodged, that North Sea and Helgoland Eight stood off the Russian attack, would be to drastically alter the very fabric of Diplomacy, for it would present in every instance an opportunity to insure an attacker's point of origin while leaving the attacker free to attempt a move. I do not believe that Diplomacy would be played as it is now played under that sort of ruling. In all cases, I would consider the very ruling which Gilliland argues is the proper one to completely change the game -- and introduce a new luck variable. Who wouldn't try one-shot guess attacks if he knows his own province can be covered in case the move fails?

In other words, a ruling different from the one I made in this case would be, I would say, a variant game.

When you paid your game fee you paid for several services. You asked me to compile and publish your moves, and to INTERPRET THE RULEBOOK AS STRICTLY AS POSSIBLE TO THE BEST OF MY ABILITY AND UNDERSTANDING.

In this ruling, logic is on my side -- and so is the rulebook. However, Alexis seems to imply in his letter, "You play by MY interpretations or I don't play." Well, run your own magazine, then. Mine is played by the book, and that's the way I think DIPLOMACY should be played.

Gilliland has been replaced by Mark Owings (see C) who has declared civil government in France collapsed. He is the logical replacement, since he knows the game and the players -- and the alliance system. He was an ally of England's.

In XF another situation came up. It could come up in 7-man. Viz! F W. MED TO MID-ATL. (Italy). F ENGLISH CHAN TO MID-ATL (GB).

but, France, F BREST TO MID-ATL; F BASC (S) DREST-MID-ATL.

Who makes it? I say France does, and did, in XF. It did so because it had the superior force. Please note that a ruling that the English and Italian separate attacks stood off the French double attack would have meant that two independent moves constitute a support. I can not accept this. In real life, things would happen as separate engagements, not simultaneously. I rule that the French fight off both single attacks AS SINGLE ATTACKS, 2-1 both times.

If anyone can justify any other ruling on either of the above they are welcome to try. However, to do so would mean, in the first point, throwing the rulebook out, and, in the second, would mean convincing me that move orders constitute supporting factors under certain conditions, something I am not yet ready to accept.

My best to you all;

JACK CHALKER

GB-1965-B
SPRING, 1910 MOVES

UPPER CASE MOVES SUCCEED
lower case moves fail

ITALY.....A WALES TO PICARDY
(Mebane) F ENGCHAN (C) WAL-PIC
F LIVERPOOL-NOR ATL
f london-north sea
a belgium to rhur
A RURG (S) bel-rhur
A MARSEILLES-PIEDMONT
A APULIA TO VENICE
f ionian to adriatic
f e.med to ionian
F W.MED TO TYRRHENIAN
a syria to armenia

TURKEY.....A YORKS (S) ED-LIVERP
(Miller) A CLYDE (S) ED-LIVERP
A EDINBURGH TO LIVERP
f norwegian-north sea
a sweden to denmark
a moscow to sevast.
a sevast to armenia
A SMYRNA STANDS
F CONST (S) F AEGEAN
F AEGEAN (S) A SMYRNA

HOLLAND....f holland to north sea
(Reinsel)

DENMARK....no move received
(Oounds) FLEET DENMARK STANDS

AUSTRIA...A KIEL (S) mun-rhur
(Clark) a munich to rhur
a bohemia to munich
A WARSAW STANDS
A RUMANIA STANDS
A VIENNA TO TYROLIA
f trieste to adriatic
a budapest to trieste
A ALBANIA STANDS
f greece to ionian

=====

There are no retreats. DEADLINE
FOR FALL, 1910 MOVE ORDERS IS
FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 1966, AT
9 PM EASTERN DAYLIGHT TIME. I
added the hour to make it uni-
form with Oounds, who changed
his deadlines without knowing
that I'd changed mine.

=====

PROPAGANDA: We are painting large
red and white bullseyes on both
sides of our last capital ship!
Won't someone PLEASE "Sink the
Bismarck!"

Constantinople: D.K., Austria,
let's get Italy! ON TO ROME!!

=====

XI POSTPONED

GB-1966-XI has been postponed indefinitely. I can not, after getting back to work, see how I can possible run such a complex game in the spare time I have -- not for a while yet, anyway.

A new regular game, however, would not take up as much of my time! They are relatively quick to figure out and handle. Thus, I will probably be announcing G in the near future.

My apologies to those who applied for XI. I hope to be able to do it at a different and better time. Don Miller, why don't you do a blitz Diplomacy game Kriegspiel style?

GB-1965-C
SPRING, 1909 MOVES

MOVES IN UPPER CASE SUCCEED
moves in lower case do not

GILLILAND GOVERNMENT FALLS IN ENGLAND
OWINGS ASSUMES PRIME-MINISTERSHIP
CIVIL GOVERNMENT COLLAPSES IN FRANCE!

FRANCE.....a marseilles stands
(civil collapse) F PORTUGAL STANDS

TURKEY.....A ROME TO MARSEILLES
(Mebane) F TYRRHENIAN--(C) RO-MARS
F LYON (C) RO-MARS
A PIED (S) ROME-MARS
a spain (s) RO-MARS
F W.MED (S) A SPAIN
A GREECE TO TUNIS
F IONIAN (C) GRE-TUNIS
A CONSTANT TO GREECE
F AEGEAN (C) CON-GREECE
A SMYRNA STANDS

ENGLAND....F EDINBURGH STANDS
A KIEL TO DENMARK
F HEL.D. (S) KIEL-DEN
F NORTHSE (S) KIEL-DEN
a holland to kiel
A RHUR (S) holl-kiel
a gascony to spain
F MIDATL (S) gasc-sp.

RUSSIA....F NORWEGIAN TO CLYDE
(Brooks) F ST.P (NC) TO NORWAY
F NORWAY TO SKAG
F SWEDEN (S) f den.
f den. (s) MUN-KIEL
F DALTIC (S) MUN-KIEL
A LIVONIA TO ST.PETE
A BERLIN (S) MUN-KIEL
A SILESIA (S) TYR-MUN
A BOHEMIA (S) TYR-MUN
A TYROLIA TO MUNICH
F ADRIATIC TO VENICE
A MUNICH TO KIEL

=====
Russian F Denmark is dislodged
and can not retreat. F DENMARK
IS ELIMINATED. This is getting
monotonous....

France is declared in a state of
collapse of civil government. Alex
Gilliland resigned, and it
was thought best to replace him
with his ally and C game player

=====
for the least interruption or
disruption to play. 3 others also applied, but Owings submitted
the moves. PLEASE SEE PAGES ONE AND TWO. They concern a rules in-
terpretation based upon this game, and which was the cause of Gil-
liland's resignation. Although not all gamesmasters agree with me,
Miller and Boardman have both upheld my interpretations as legal.
DEADLINE FOR THE FALL, 1909 MOVE ORDERS IS FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 1966,
AT 9 PM EASTERN DAYLIGHT TIME.

No propaganda was submitted this time.

XX

X
F

XF PROPAGANDA (CONTINUED FROM PAGE SIX)

regular diplomatic encounter: during a fete at the ancestral
seat of the Dukes of Cleveland, the Prime Minister met with
the heads of state of France, Germany, and Russia, who had
all arrived incognito. His Grace Jason, tenth Duke of Cleve-
land, Earl of Sheraton, Marquess of Tricon, denied any at-
tempt on his part to arrange such a confrontation.

XX

Incidentally, Baltimore did not receive sufficient votes to beat
New York City for the worldcon bid. Now that Syracuse says it's
through bidding, and NYC has its con, Baltimore will bid again at
the next legal opportunity which is considered fair. We still have
the best convention to offer....

Well, see you all in NYC next year, anyway.... JLC.

五

UPPER CASE MOVES SUCCEED
lower case moves fail

TURKEY....F GREECE TO ALBANIA
(Von Metzke) a serbia-trieste

A CONST TO BULGARIA
A ANKARA TO RUMANIA
F BLACK (C) ANK-RUM
A SMYRNA TO CONSTANT
A UKRAINA TO GALICIA
A SEVAST (S) ANK-RUM
f tunis to tyrrhenian
f ionian to tyrrhenian
F ROME TO TUSCANY

=====

=Sorry, Conrad -- only 1 fleet

=at a time allowed in the Ionian.

=There are no retreats. DEADLINE

=FOR FALL, 1906 MOVE ORDERS IS

=FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 1966, AT

=9 P.M. EASTERN DAYLIGHT TIME.

=====

= PROPAGANDA
 =Vienna: Tuck in your napkins,
 =England and France -- it's Tur-
 =key for dinner!
 =Moscow (Universal Russian Repress)
 =The Mad Satirical Monk today
 =gave a lecture on Viennese col-
 =turb before the Czarist Univer-

Constantinople: The Sultan of the increasingly large Turkish Empire today defined his intended sphere of influence. "We shall conquer from the Gates of Hercules to the Fertile Crescent, from the Origin of the Nile to the Sudetenland, from the Swiss Alps to Bilbao. Our dominion includes our homeland and all the Arab states; the degenerate Empire now under Austrian oppression; the southern Russian provinces of Moscow, Kiev, and Sevastopol (in short, the entire Dnieper River Valley); all the Balkan States, to which we have already brought protection and peace; the entire peninsula of the former Italian Kingdom, excepting Rome itself; Tunisia and the Barbary States; and the Iberian Peninsula up to the Pyrenees. Anybody who wants the rest is welcome to it; the area we have just described is eighteen supply centers, which is all we care about."

Simultaneously the Sultan declared war on France and England. "We are already at war with the Pretender in Austria, and with the morbid remnant of the Russian tyranny. This is a pretty comprehensive state of affairs, if we do say so ourselves. Out, by God, it's going to be fun!" Rumours reaching Western correspondents here that King Edward of England had been hanged in effigy were unconfirmed, although one reporter found, in the Ministry of Foreign Trade, an invoice in the "incoming" bin for 37 pounds of hay and a slightly used work suit purchased from one L.F. Daum.

GD-1966-XF
SPRING, 1902 MOVES

Xf

UPPER CASE MOVES SUCCEED
lower case moves fail

ITALY.....F CORSICA TO TYRRHEN.
(Gemignani)f naples (c) a apulia
to Ionian

A Apulia to ionian

A TUSCANY TO PIEDMONT

A VENICE STANDS & WAITS

AUSTRIA....F TRIESTE TO ADRIATIC
(Thomson) A VIENNA (S) BUDAPEST

A SERBIA TO RUMANIA

A BUD (S) SERBIA-RUM.

ENGLAND....F IRELAND TO NOR ATL
(Mebane) F LIVERPOOL TO IRISH SEA
F ENGLISH CHAN.-NORTH S.
A EDINBURGH TO YORKS.

TURKEY.....F CRETE TO IONIAN
(Huff) F SMYRNA TO SEGEAN
A BULG (S) CON-SALK.
A CONST-SALKONIA
A ANKARA TO CONSTNT.
A PERSIA TO SYRIA

GERMANY....A BERLIN STANDS
(Schultz) A MUNICH STANDS
no moves A RHUR STANDS
received F BELGIUM STANDS

SCANDINAVIA..F ICELAND TO NORWEG.
(Levinson)A OSLO TO STOCKHOLM
A FINLAND STANDS
F DALTIC STANDS

BARBARY..A SARDINIA STANDS
(Reinsel) F TRIPOLI TO IONIAN
F MOROCCO TO MID-ATL
F W.MED (S) MOR-MID-ATL

RUSSIA....A RIGA TO PRUSSIA
(Brooks) F ST.PETE (SC) TO RIGA
A WARS (S) GAL-SILESIA
A GALICIA TO SILESIA
A UKRAINA TO GALICIA
a rumania (s) I bul-serb

FRANCE....F SPAIN STANDS
(Jacks) f mid-atl stands
no moves A BURGUNDY STANDS
received A MARSEILLES STANDS

=====

+Jacks & Schultz probably are suf-
+fering from Post-Worldconitus.
+RUSSIAN ARMY RUMANIA IS DISLODGED
+AND MUST RETREAT TO UKRAINA OR
+SEVASTOPOL. FRENCH F MID-ATLANTIC
+IS DISLODGED AND MUST RETREAT TO

*****PORTUGAL, GASCONY, BREST, ENGLISH
CHANNEL, According to XF rules, these retreats are to be made with
FALL, 1902 MOVES, but take precedence over fall moves. Charles Rein-
sel and Oanks Mebane are cautioned to note that they must plan for
possible retreats in their directions when moving, This is when your
alliances start paying off, folks. DEADLINE FOR FALL, 1902 MOVE ORDERS
(AND SUMMER RETREATS) IS FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 1966, AT 9 PM. EASTERN
DAYLIGHT TIME.

PROPAGANDA:

The Barbary Coast requests France to get out of the Mid-Atlantic or
a state of WAR shall exist! (signed) El Barbarian.

Moscow: Russian forces have thrown back a determined attack on
the Czarist protectorate of Silesia.

To Austria or France: Who wants to be my ally? Make an offer,
quickly. (signed) Italy.

To Turkey: Nice having you around. Too bad you're leaving.

Helsinki, March 8 (KA): "The Finnish Markkaa-Penni system will
be replaced by the national Kroner-Pöre system within a year, if there
is no trouble in obtaining the necessary coin metal," Alexis Kivi,
Treasury Minister, announced today. Most gold is shipped to the port
of Oslo from Cape Colony, in British South Africa, but with the
French and the Barbarians jockeying for control of the Atlantic, only
a few ships can get through.

London: Today Foreign Minister Sir Lyon Gaddolphus Grey was
closeted for several hours with Nicolai Grundtvig LP, Ambassador of
the Kalmar government to the Court of St. James. Informed sources
speculated that the meeting was the result of a recent, highly ir-

CONTINUED AT THE BOTTOM OF PAGE FOUR (4)